

Does it Pay to Send Multiple Pre-Paid Incentives? Evidence from a Randomized Experiment

Andrew C. Chang¹, Joanne W. Hsu, Eva Ma, Kate Bachtell,
Micah Sjoblom

¹Presenter, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System

October 22, 2024

Disclaimer

- The views and opinions expressed here are ours and are not necessarily those of the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System or its research staff.

Research Question

- Study pre-paid monetary incentives for survey respondents.
- What are the net effects of:
 - Increasing pre-paid incentive amount?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of the same amount (holding total amount fixed)?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of different amounts (holding total amount fixed)?
- Outcomes: response rates, interviewer burden, data quality.

Research Question

- Study pre-paid monetary incentives for survey respondents.
- What are the net effects of:
 - Increasing pre-paid incentive amount?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of the same amount (holding total amount fixed)?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of different amounts (holding total amount fixed)?
- Outcomes: response rates, interviewer burden, data quality.

Research Question

- Study pre-paid monetary incentives for survey respondents.
- What are the net effects of:
 - Increasing pre-paid incentive amount?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of the same amount (holding total amount fixed)?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of different amounts (holding total amount fixed)?
- Outcomes: response rates, interviewer burden, data quality.

Research Question

- Study pre-paid monetary incentives for survey respondents.
- What are the net effects of:
 - Increasing pre-paid incentive amount?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of the same amount (holding total amount fixed)?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of different amounts (holding total amount fixed)?
- Outcomes: response rates, interviewer burden, data quality.

Research Question

- Study pre-paid monetary incentives for survey respondents.
- What are the net effects of:
 - Increasing pre-paid incentive amount?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of the same amount (holding total amount fixed)?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of different amounts (holding total amount fixed)?
- Outcomes: response rates, interviewer burden, data quality.

Research Question

- Study pre-paid monetary incentives for survey respondents.
- What are the net effects of:
 - Increasing pre-paid incentive amount?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of the same amount (holding total amount fixed)?
 - Sequential pre-paid incentives of different amounts (holding total amount fixed)?
- Outcomes: response rates, interviewer burden, data quality.

Results - Total Value of Incentive

- Increasing pre-paid incentive amount?
 - Higher response rates.
 - No effect on interviewer burden or data quality.

Results - Total Value of Incentive

- Increasing pre-paid incentive amount?
 - Higher response rates.
 - No effect on interviewer burden or data quality.

Results - Total Value of Incentive

- Increasing pre-paid incentive amount?
 - Higher response rates.
 - No effect on interviewer burden or data quality.

Results - Sequential, Same Amount

- Two pre-paid incentives of the same amount (holding total amount fixed)?
 - No effects.

Results - Sequential, Same Amount

- Two pre-paid incentives of the same amount (holding total amount fixed)?
 - No effects.

Results - Sequential, Different Amounts

- Two pre-paid incentives of different amounts (holding total amount fixed)?
 - Longer time in the field.

Results - Sequential, Different Amounts

- Two pre-paid incentives of different amounts (holding total amount fixed)?
 - Longer time in the field.

Setting - Survey of Consumer Finances (SCF)

- Survey of Consumer Finances (SCF).
- Every 3 years (last in 2022).
- In person/phone mixed mode.

Setting - Survey of Consumer Finances (SCF)

- Survey of Consumer Finances (SCF).
- Every 3 years (last in 2022).
- In person/phone mixed mode.

Setting - Survey of Consumer Finances (SCF)

- Survey of Consumer Finances (SCF).
- Every 3 years (last in 2022).
- In person/phone mixed mode.

Survey of Consumer Finances (SCF) Monetary Incentives

- Both pre-paid (unconditional) and post-paid (conditional) incentives.
- Since 2016 pre-paid of 5 dollars in 1 mailer.

Survey of Consumer Finances (SCF) Monetary Incentives

- Both pre-paid (unconditional) and post-paid (conditional) incentives.
- Since 2016 pre-paid of 5 dollars in 1 mailer.

2022 SCF Experiment Treatments

- Pre-registered between-subject randomized control trial in 2022.
 - Total pre-paid incentive amount.
 - 1 or 2 pre-paid incentive payments.
 - Increase or decrease amount between two pre-paids.

2022 SCF Experiment Treatments

- Pre-registered between-subject randomized control trial in 2022.
 - Total pre-paid incentive amount.
 - 1 or 2 pre-paid incentive payments.
 - Increase or decrease amount between two pre-paids.

2022 SCF Experiment Treatments

- Pre-registered between-subject randomized control trial in 2022.
 - Total pre-paid incentive amount.
 - 1 or 2 pre-paid incentive payments.
 - Increase or decrease amount between two pre-paids.

2022 SCF Experiment Treatments

- Pre-registered between-subject randomized control trial in 2022.
 - Total pre-paid incentive amount.
 - 1 or 2 pre-paid incentive payments.
 - Increase or decrease amount between two pre-paids.

2022 SCF Experiment Treatments

- Randomized into six groups [\$amount 1/\$amount 2]:
 - \$5/\$0 - control (2016-19 pre-paid)
 - \$10/\$0
 - \$15/\$0
 - \$5/\$5
 - \$10/\$5
 - \$5/\$10
- All respondents sent two mailers.

2022 SCF Experiment Treatments

- Randomized into six groups [\$amount 1/\$amount 2]:
 - \$5/\$0 - control (2016-19 pre-paid)
 - \$10/\$0
 - \$15/\$0
 - \$5/\$5
 - \$10/\$5
 - \$5/\$10
- All respondents sent two mailers.

2022 SCF Experiment Treatments

- Randomized into six groups [\$amount 1/\$amount 2]:
 - \$5/\$0 - control (2016-19 pre-paid)
 - \$10/\$0
 - \$15/\$0
 - \$5/\$5
 - \$10/\$5
 - \$5/\$10
- All respondents sent two mailers.

Why Might Sequential Incentives Affect Survey Outcomes?

- Second chance.
- Reminder.
- Higher-value.
- Backfire.

Why Might Sequential Incentives Affect Survey Outcomes?

- Second chance.
- Reminder.
- Higher-value.
- Backfire.

Why Might Sequential Incentives Affect Survey Outcomes?

- Second chance.
- Reminder.
- Higher-value.
- Backfire.

Why Might Sequential Incentives Affect Survey Outcomes?

- Second chance.
- Reminder.
- Higher-value.
- Backfire.

Why Might Sequential Incentives Affect Survey Outcomes?

- Second chance.
- Reminder.
- Higher-value.
- Backfire.

2022 SCF Experiment Details

- Sample sizes:
 - \$5/\$0: ~2,100.
 - Remaining groups, ~1,300.
- Between-group comparisons have at least ~2,600.

2022 SCF Experiment Details

- Sample sizes:
 - \$5/\$0: ~2,100.
 - Remaining groups, ~1,300.
- Between-group comparisons have at least ~2,600.

2022 SCF Experiment Details

- Sample sizes:
 - \$5/\$0: ~2,100.
 - Remaining groups, ~1,300.
- Between-group comparisons have at least ~2,600.

2022 SCF Experiment Details

- Sample sizes:
 - \$5/\$0: ~2,100.
 - Remaining groups, ~1,300.
- Between-group comparisons have at least ~2,600.

2022 SCF Experiment Details

- Experimental period: April - June 2022.
- Randomization stratified on primarily sampling unit.
- No rerandomization.
- Field staff not aware of pre-paid incentive amounts (no Hawthorne effects).
- Delivered by USPS.
- Windowed envelope.

NORC at the University of Chicago

55 East Monroe Street, 19th Floor
Chicago IL 60603



*****AUTO**MIXED ABCD 999

999 / 9969696 / TRR1 G9 59_808

HOUSEHOLD RESIDENT

55 E STREET ST

ANYTOWN, SS 90990



Outcomes - Response Rates

- Appointments.
- Completes (AAPOR RR1).

Outcomes - Field Interviewer Burden

- Interviewer contact attempts before an appointment.
- Interviewer contact attempts before complete.
- Days before complete.

Outcomes - Data Quality

- Item response rates.
- Item response rates among dollar value questions.

Hypothesis Testing

- OLS regressions on treatment indicators.
- Multiple hypothesis testing control using FWER (Westfall-Young, 1993).

Higher Total Incentive Amounts

- Treatment: \$10/\$0 and \$15/\$0.
- Control: \$5/\$0.
- Higher response rates (~2-3 p.p.).
- No effect on other survey outcomes.
- No negative effects of higher amount.

Higher Total Incentive Amounts

- Treatment: \$10/\$0 and \$15/\$0.
- Control: \$5/\$0.
- Higher response rates (~2-3 p.p.).
- No effect on other survey outcomes.
- No negative effects of higher amount.

Higher Total Incentive Amounts

- Treatment: \$10/\$0 and \$15/\$0.
- Control: \$5/\$0.
- Higher response rates (~2-3 p.p.).
- No effect on other survey outcomes.
- No negative effects of higher amount.

Sequential Incentives

- Treatment: \$5/\$5.
- Control: \$10/\$0.
- Results conditioned on total amount.
- No significant effects.

Sequential Incentives

- Treatment: \$5/\$5.
- Control: \$10/\$0.
- Results conditioned on total amount.
- No significant effects.

Slope Effect

- Treatment: \$5/\$10 and \$10/\$5.
- Control: \$15/\$0.
- Longer time in field, ~5 days.

Slope Effect

- Treatment: \$5/\$10 and \$10/\$5.
- Control: \$15/\$0.
- Longer time in field, ~5 days.

Summary

- Best option: one mailer with more \$.
- Questions? andrew.c.chang@frb.gov

Summary

- Best option: one mailer with more \$.
- Questions? andrew.c.chang@frb.gov

Summary

- Best option: one mailer with more \$.
- Questions? andrew.c.chang@frb.gov